Measuring Integration of Immigrants

Settling in

Indicators of immigrant integration - 2015

World Bank, Washington
Thursday, August 27, 2015
12:30 - 2:00

Jean-Christophe Dumont
Head of the International Migration Division
Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs, OECD
What are the issues?

• International migration is gaining importance in the OECD but labour market and social integration outcomes are not quite favourable in many countries => risk of a backlash against migration/immigrants & under-use of their skills

• It is important to monitor integration outcomes to
  – (i) avoid misconceptions
  – (ii) adapt infrastructure capacities (integration services for recent migrants as well as health, education, housing, labour market policies, etc.)
  – (iii) design efficient public policies that maximise short and long-term benefits of migration
Settling in 2015
Indicators of Immigrant Integration

• Joint work with the European Commission

• First broad international comparison across all EU and OECD countries of the outcomes for immigrants and their children

• 34 key indicators on the integration of immigrants and their children, including:
  – Extensive contextual information on the demographic characteristics of immigrants and their children
  – Five main areas of integration: Employment, education and skills, social inclusion, civic engagement and social cohesion

• 2 special chapters:
  – Third-country nationals in the EU (“Zaragoza indicators”)
  – Youth with a migration background

• Peer groups of countries which have a similar relative size and composition of the immigrant population

• Publication can be downloaded for free here: [www.oecd.org/migration/integrationindicators](http://www.oecd.org/migration/integrationindicators)
Country notes and an online interactive tool to compare countries are also available on the website
Comparing the foreign-born... with whom?

With the *native-born*
- overall
- native-born with similar characteristics

Comparison over time

With *other migrants*
- other groups of migrants within a country
- migrants in other countries
In the OECD, one person in five has a migration background.

Population share of immigrants and of native-born offspring of immigrants, around 2013

Percentage of the total population

- Immigrants (foreign-born)
- Native-born with at least one foreign-born parent
Recent arrivals have problems to integrate in the labour market in virtually all countries.

Differences in employment rates of recent (<10 years of residence) and settled (>=10 years) immigrants compared to those of native-born, persons aged 15-64 years old, 2012-13

Percentage points

Differences in the outcomes of recent arrivals across countries largely reflect differences in the composition of the immigrant intake by migration category.
In spite of some convergence over time, gaps vis-à-vis native-born remain large in most areas.

Dispersion of recent and settled immigrants measured against key indicators relative to the native-born, persons aged 15-64, 2012-13

Native-born = 100

Diversity within the immigrant population is generally larger than among the native-born, but there is some convergence over time within the immigrant population.
Persisting large unemployment gaps in Europe

Unemployment rates by place of birth in the EU and the USA, 2008-2014

Europe

United States

Foreign-born  Native-born

4.5 pp

5.0 pp

0.4 pp

-0.4 pp
Differences in employment rates compared with native-born are often large for the high-educated, but less so for the low-educated.

Employment rates of foreign-born population aged 15-64 and not in education, by education level, 2012-13

Differences with native-born, in percentage points

Cross-country differences for the low-educated are largely driven by differences in the composition by migration category (labour, family, humanitarian)
Qualification is not a guarantee of success for immigrants

• The share of high-educated among the immigrant population has grown by four percentage points since 2006-07

• High-educated immigrants face more difficulties in getting a job than their native-born peers…

• …and when in employment, those with foreign education face a much higher incidence of overqualification
  – 41% vs. 29% for those with host-country qualification
  – Almost two-thirds of immigrants have foreign qualifications

• As a result, tertiary qualifications do not necessarily protect from poor living conditions
  – 11% face in-work poverty (5% for their native-born peers)
Low-educated are relatively often employed, but their long-term integration outcomes tend to be unfavourable

- High employment rates come often at the price of low job quality
- The result is a high incidence of in-work poverty (37% vs. 17% for low-educated native-born) and overcrowded housing conditions (29% vs. 11%)
- Many lack basic skills (as measured by the OECD PIAAC survey)
  - 32% of immigrants have only basic skills (native-born: 13%)
  - Only half of those employed participate in job-related training, compared with two thirds for their native-born peers
  - This raises the question of employability
Foreign-born youth and youth with immigrant parents account for a large and growing proportion of youth.

Note: * 15 – 34 years old

"migrant background" refers to youth who either immigrated as children or are native-born with at least one immigrant parent.
There is a high sentiment of discrimination among immigrant offspring in Europe

Persons who consider themselves members of a group that is or has been discriminated against on the ground of ethnicity, nationality or race, selected OECD countries, 2002-12

As a percentage of all foreign-born/native-born with two foreign-born parents, persons aged 15-64 and 15-34
In Europe, offspring of immigrants are twice as often among the most marginalised.

Youth (15-34) who are both low-educated and not in employment, education and training (NEET), by origin of parents, around 2013
Immigrant offspring students with low-educated parents are less likely to succeed than their peers with native-born parents.

Shares of resilient 15-year-old students, by migration background, 2012

A high concentration of children of immigrants in schools is only an issue if their parents are low-educated, as is often the case in European OECD countries.
## The scoreboard: comparisons across peer groups – how do immigrant vs. native differences compare with those in other countries?

### Difference between the foreign- and the native-born compared with the average difference in the OECD (at 1% level)
- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Settlement countries
- Australia
- New Zealand
- Israel
- Canada

### Longstanding countries of immigration
- Luxembourg
- Switzerland
- United States
- United Kingdom

### Destinations with significant recent and humanitarian migration
- Austria
- Belgium
- Germany
- France
- Netherlands
- Sweden
- Norway
- Denmark
- Finland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Australia</th>
<th>New Zealand</th>
<th>Israel</th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>Luxembourg</th>
<th>Switzerland</th>
<th>United States</th>
<th>United Kingdom</th>
<th>Austria</th>
<th>Belgium</th>
<th>Germany</th>
<th>France</th>
<th>Netherlands</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overqualification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcrowding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth: PISA scores</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth: NEET rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>current trend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Current trend

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Overqualification

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Poverty

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Overcrowding

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Health

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Youth: PISA scores

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available

### Youth: NEET rate

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available
New destinations with many recent labour migrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Low-educated</th>
<th>High educated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Iceland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overqualification</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poverty</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overcrowding</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Youth: Education (PISA)</th>
<th>current</th>
<th>trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Youth: NEET</th>
<th>current</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Countries with immigrant population shaped by border changes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estonia</th>
<th>Slovenia</th>
<th>Czech Republic</th>
<th>Hungary</th>
<th>Slovak Republic</th>
<th>Poland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Difference between the foreign- and the native-born compared with the average difference in the OECD (at 1% level)

- More favourable than the foreign-born
- Less favourable than the foreign-born
- Comparable to the native-born
- Data not available
Key findings … and selected policy challenges

- Although no country is among the best on all indicators, immigrants in European OECD countries tend to fare less well than in the OECD settlement countries => composition of migration matters (skill level, age at migration, migrant category etc.)

- Integration outcomes have deteriorated with the 2007/08 crisis, but the risk of a scarring effect is noticeable, particularly in Europe

- Having a high educational attainment is, by itself, no guarantee for good integration outcomes for immigrants themselves, but it is strongly associated with good outcomes for their children

- Low educated immigrants have relatively favourable labour market outcomes compared to native born but have more precarious jobs and in European OECD countries, their children face serious difficulties both in school and in the labour market and often feel discriminated against => this may put social cohesion at risk and represents the single most important integration challenge facing OECD countries

- Good labour market outcomes have strong links with many other integration dimensions and condition the ability of migrants to function as autonomous, productive and successful citizens

- Previous OECD work on integration has emphasised the need to (i) recognise and value the skills immigrants bring with them, (ii) help immigrants develop the skills they need to live and work in their new homes and (iii) put immigrants’ skills to good use

For more information on possible policy responses see for example:
- OECD (2014), How can immigrants’ skills be put to use?, Migration policy debate n°3
Further OECD work on integration:
Contact: jean-christophe.dumont@oecd.org

OECD Indicators of Immigrant Integration:
https://www.compareyourcountry.org/indicators-of-immigrant-integration

...the Integration of the Children of Immigrants

... Naturalization and Integration Outcomes

... Immigrant Entrepreneurship

... Country Studies